

# Post-glacial migration of silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in the south-western Alps

Serge D. Muller<sup>1</sup>\*, Takeshi Nakagawa<sup>2</sup>, Jacques-Louis de Beaulieu<sup>3</sup>, Mona Court-Picon<sup>3</sup>, Christopher Carcaillet<sup>4</sup>, Cécile Miramont<sup>3</sup>, Paul Roiron<sup>4</sup>, Clément Boutterin<sup>3</sup>, Adam A. Ali<sup>4</sup> and Hélène Bruneton<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Equipe Paléoenvironnement, Institut des Sciences de l'Evolution de Montpellier, case 061, Université de Montpellier-2, 34095 Montpellier cedex 05, France, <sup>2</sup>Department of Geography, Room 4.20, Daysh Building, University of Newcastle, Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 7RU, UK, <sup>3</sup>Institut Méditerranéen d'Ecologie et de Paléoécologie, Europôle Méditerranéen de l'Arbois, BP 80, 13545 Aixen-Provence cedex 04, France, <sup>4</sup>Centre de Bio-Archéologie et d'Ecologie, Institut de Botaniaue, 163 rue Broussonet, 34090 Montpellier, France and <sup>5</sup>Centre Européen de Recherche et d'Enseignement de Géosciences de l'Environnement, Europôle Méditerranéen de l'Arbois, BP 80, 13545 Aix-en-Provence cedex 04, France

### ABSTRACT

**Aim** Previous studies have failed to reconstruct the regional post-glacial migration pattern of *Abies alba* in southern France. Based on the first exhaustive compilation of palaeoecological data in this region, we present the state-of-the-art and attempt to synthesize the available information concerning glacial refugia and post-glacial migration, and analyse the information with regard to climate and orography.

Location South-western Alps and adjacent areas, southern France.

**Methods** The work compiles the available palaeoecological data in the southwestern Alps (52 sites, 290 radiocarbon dates). The post-glacial migration pattern of *Abies alba* is reconstructed based on 22 selected palynological analyses (11 welldated reference sites and 11 supplementary ones).

**Results** The geographical patterns of approaching area limit, immigration and expansion are reconstructed at the scale of the southern French Alps.

**Main conclusions** Despite previous assertions, the evidence of refugia in southern France is non-existent. The late-glacial records of fir pollen, previously interpreted in French Mediterranean regions and on adjacent foot-hills as possibly reflecting regional refugia, most probably correspond to reworking phenomena or long-distance pollen transport. Fir migration, originating in the Apennine refugia and through the south-western extremity of the Alps, was extremely rapid in the southern French Alps, only spanning a few centuries between 10,100 and 9800 cal. yr BP. The subsequent spread of fir populations was controlled by local parameters, such as the aridity of the inner valleys, which resulted in a delayed expansion in comparison to other regions. *Abies* almost disappeared from the south-western Alps during the Roman era, around 2000 cal. yr BP.

\*Correspondence: Serge D. Muller, ISE-M, case 061, Université Montpellier-2, F-34095 Montpellier cedex 05, France. E-mail: smuller@univ-montp2.fr

#### **Keywords**

*Abies alba*, France, glacial refugia, Holocene, late-glacial, migration, palaeoecology, pollen, topography.

### INTRODUCTION

The continental-scale post-glacial migration patterns of European trees are mainly inferred from pollen, sometimes supported by plant macroremains and genetic data (e.g. Huntley & Birks, 1983; Brewer *et al.*, 2002; Petit *et al.*, 2002; Ravazzi, 2002; Conedera *et al.*, 2004; Giesecke & Bennett, 2004; Terhürne-Berson *et al.*, 2004; van der Knaap *et al.*, 2005). Despite attention being paid to the choice of the palaeodata used, the conclusions may be locally affected by several factors: (1) the irregular geographical and topographic grid, determined by the distribution of lakes and wetlands, (2) the heterogeneous quality of the pollen data, related to sampling methods, pollen sums, determination criteria and taxonomic nomenclature, and (3) the heterogeneous quality of the chronological control. The quality of the chronology mainly depends on the number of datings and methods used (i.e. radiometric dating of bulk sediment or terrestrial macrofossils, varve counting, or the less suitable regional pollen stratigraphy), and could be affected by the effects of hard water or disturbed sediments. Despite these general limitations, broadscale reconstructions point to major discrepancies between regions and highlight the south-western Alps as one of the least known regions, where palaeoecological studies still fail to provide a consistent pattern of plant dynamics at the regional scale.

The southern French Alps cover a geographical zone of c. 300 by 150 km, and represent the south-western boundary of the Alps. Subjected to contrasting influences of Mediterranean, mountain and continental climates, this region comprises the maximum area of aridity in the whole Alps (Ozenda, 1985). This is reflected by the presence of relict steppe taxa such as Juniperus thurifera and Astragalus alopecurus. Despite these unfavourable conditions for wetlands, a large number of palaeoecological studies have been carried out over the past half century, since the pioneer work of Becker (1952): notably de Beaulieu (1977), Wegmüller (1977), Coûteaux (1982a), Clerc (1988), David (1993), Fauquette & Talon (1995), Carcaillet (1996), Talon (1997), Nakagawa (1998), Muller et al. (2000), Pothin (2000) and Ali (2003). However, the majority of these studies are not computerized in pollen data bases such as the European Pollen Database (EPD), which seriously complicates all attempts to reconstruct vegetation patterns at the regional scale. Furthermore, only a few macrofossil studies have been made in the region, creating a gap in the available data for historical plant biogeography and reconstructions of past vegetation, since macroremains provide useful additional information such as higher taxonomic resolution and smaller spatial scales of origin (Birks & Birks, 2000).

This study is based on the compilation of pollen, macroremains and radiocarbon data currently available from the south-western Alps and adjacent areas, and aims to evaluate the potential of this data set for reconstructing the past dynamics of vegetation at a regional scale. It focuses more specifically on the controversial spatiotemporal pattern of the post-glacial migration of silver fir (Abies alba) at the scale of the south-western Alps. The existence of glacial refugia and the migration routes of silver fir in southern France are still not firmly resolved (Nakagawa, 1998; van der Knaap et al., 2005). Despite the inability of palynology to document small stands of trees, particularly in unfavourable climatic contexts (Kullman, 1996, 1998, 2002; Ali et al., 2003, 2005; Brubaker et al., 2005; Tinner & Lotter, 2006), the compiled palaeoecological data could provide evidence for refugial areas in two ways: directly by the comparison between pollen and macrofossil records, and indirectly by the timing of the expansion of fir forests, which should have occurred earlier if it resulted from the spread of local residual populations rather than by immigration from distant areas. The temporal and spatial variability of these processes is discussed in the light of climatic forcing and the orographic

context: climatic forcing should result in homogeneous patterns of tree dynamics at a broad scale, whereas physiographical and orographic influences should be more heterogeneous both in time and space. The compiled data set is then used to attempt a preliminary evaluation of the existence of glacial refugia for *Abies* in southern France, and to discuss the migrational response of *Abies* to climate change.

# PRESENT AND PAST DISTRIBUTION OF ABIES IN EUROPE

### **Present-day distribution**

Abies alba Mill. (= Abies pectinata (Lam.) DC) covers the main mountain areas of central and southern Europe (Fig. 1a). This species has populations in Mediterranean climatic zones, in north-eastern Spain (Catalonia), in southern Italy (Calabria) and in southern France (Pre-Alps of Provence, southern Maritime Alps and Pyrenees). In Calabria and in the Pyrenees, *A. alba* populations belong to particular ecotypes, genetically differentiated from other populations (Vicario *et al.*, 1995; Fady *et al.*, 1999), suggesting their ancient separation from the main distribution area. On the other hand, populations in Corsica belong to the Euro-Siberian group (Gamisans, 1999), in agreement with palynological data, which indicate the recent immigration of silver fir to the island (Reille *et al.*, 1999).

Abies alba is generally associated with beech (Fagus sylvatica) in lower and middle mountain belts, and with spruce (Picea abies) in the upper mountain belt. Moreover, it forms pure forests in the sub-alpine belt in certain zones of the southern Alps, where spruce is absent (Rameau et al., 1989-93). In the southern French Alps and Pre-Alps (alpine foot-hills), Abies alba displays a large altitudinal amplitude, ranging from 500 to 2000 m a.s.l. Mediterranean fir forests contain species characteristic of fir-beech forests (including the rare Androsace chaixii), generally mixed with Quercus ilex, Quercus pubescens, Buxus sempervirens, Fagus sylvatica, Pinus sylvestris and some thermophilous species of deciduous oak forests (Tessier du Cros, 1981; Quézel & Médail, 2003). In contrast, the floristic assemblage of the altitudinal fir forests in the Durance Valley is more similar to those from the outer Alps, from which they differ by the occurrence of Luzula luzulina and Listera cordata. Recent land-use abandonment resulted in abundant regeneration of Abies alba within forests of Pinus sylvestris, Pinus uncinata and Picea abies, notably in the southern French and Italian Alps (Motta & Garbarino, 2003; Rameau et al., 1989-93; Quézel & Médail, 2003; Motta & Edouard, 2005).

In Europe, there are four Mediterranean species of *Abies* restricted to small areas (Tutin *et al.*, 1964–80; Quézel & Médail, 2003; Fig. 1a): *Abies pinsapo* Boiss., which could include *Abies marocana* Trabut of Maghreb (Scaltsoyiannes *et al.*, 1999), covers north-facing slopes on limestone mountains in southern Spain; *Abies nebrodensis* (Lojac) Mattei is



**Figure 1** (a) Present range of *Abies* species in Europe (after Tutin *et al.*, 1964–80; Jalas & Suominen, 1973; Quézel & Médail, 2003). (b) Glacial refugia and probable routes of migration of *Abies* species (after Nakagawa, 1998; Terhürne-Berson *et al.*, 2004). Circled numbers refer to refugia locations detailed in the text. LGM is used for Last Glacial Maximum.

endemic in the north of Sicily and is currently restricted to 50 individuals on the Madonie Range, *Abies cephalonica* Loudon and *Abies borisii-regis* Mattf. both occur in Greece, southwards of the southern limit of silver fir. *Abies borisii-regis* is thought to be a hybrid between *Abies alba* and a

Tertiary ancestral fir (Fady *et al.*, 1992; Fady & Conkle, 1993; Fady, 1995).

Finally, *Abies sibirica* forms extensive boreal forests in northeastern Russia, westwards to *c*.  $41^{\circ}$  E and southwards to *c*.  $55^{\circ}$  N (Tutin *et al.*, 1964–80).

### Location of glacial refugia

Since fir species cannot be distinguished in palynological analyses, studies related to their glacial refugia generally concern the genus only. Four European regions may be considered as possible glacial refugia for *Abies* (Terhürne-Berson *et al.*, 2004; Fig. 1b):

1. Greece, in the southern Balkans massif (Bottema, 1974; Huntley & Birks, 1983; Lang, 1992; Tzedakis *et al.*, 2002), is the most probable glacial refugial area for the two endemic species *Abies cephalonica* and *Abies borisii-regis*, perhaps in association with *Abies alba*;

**2.** refugia in southern Italy (Grüger, 1977; Watts, 1985; Bennett *et al.*, 1991; Lang, 1992) are supported by ecophysiological investigations (Larsen, 1986, 1989) and genetic studies (Bergmann *et al.*, 1990; Konnert & Bergmann, 1995; Vicario *et al.*, 1995). These studies suggest moreover that the Calabrian populations of *Abies alba* have remained isolated from those of other European regions since the last glacial maximum (LGM). Southern Italy also comprises the refugial zone of the endemic and currently endangered *Abies nebrodensis*;

**3.** the Pyrenees and surrounding areas in north-eastern Spain and south-western France (van Campo & Jalut, 1969; Jalut, 1970, 1973a,b; Pons *et al.*, 1974; Uzquiano, 1992; Reille & Lowe, 1993; Pérez-Obiol & Julià, 1994) comprise another important refugial area for *Abies alba*. As for southern Italy, the *Abies* populations of the Pyrenees have been shown to be genetically distinct from those of other European regions (Konnert & Bergmann, 1995; Fady *et al.*, 1999). This suggests that the Pyrenees refugia did not play any role in the northward spread of silver fir during the post-glacial period (Terhürne-Berson *et al.*, 2004);

**4.** the northern Apennines, in north-western Italy (Bertoldi, 1968, 1980; Bennett *et al.*, 1991; Lowe, 1992; Ponel & Lowe, 1992; Lowe & Watson, 1993; Watson, 1996), the Insubrian southern Alps (Schneider, 1978; Hofstetter *et al.*, 2006) and possibly south-eastern France (de Beaulieu, 1974; Triat-Laval, 1979; Nicol-Pichard, 1987; Nicol-Pichard & Dubar, 1998) would constitute potential refugial areas and the most probable origin for the post-glacial expansion of *Abies alba* throughout northern Europe (de Beaulieu *et al.*, 1984; Clerc, 1988; Brugiapaglia, 1996; Nakagawa, 1998; Terhürne-Berson *et al.*, 2004).

There may have been other glacial refugia of *Abies alba* east of the Alps, but if so they probably disappeared before the LGM, since no palaeobotanical record indicates their survival during the late-glacial (Terhürne-Berson *et al.*, 2004):

**5.** northern Balkans (Turk *et al.*, 1988–89; Šercelj & Culiberg, 1991; Culiberg & Šercelj, 1995; Gliemeroth, 1995), where *Abies* charcoal is found in Palaeolithic caves, and dated to 38,000 and 20,000 yr BP, respectively;

**6.** Moravia, in the southern Czech Republic (Willis & van Andel, 2004), where *Abies* charcoal from archaeological layers is preserved below loess deposits and dated between 43,000 and 20,000 yr BP.

Finally, an additional refugial area is suggested, but not for *Abies alba* (Terhürne-Berson *et al.*, 2004):

7. southern Spain (Pons & Reille, 1988) constitutes the most probable refugial area for the endemic *Abies pinsapo*, although no evidence has yet been found.

### Late-glacial and post-glacial migration patterns

According to Terhürne-Berson et al. (2004) and van der Knaap et al. (2005), the most probable routes of migration of Abies alba are shown in Fig. 1b. Fir populations in the Pyrenees and Calabria are considered to have been isolated since the last glacial period. Consequently, the most likely origins for the spread of silver fir towards northern Europe are the Balkans Peninsula, the northern Apennines and, maybe, south-eastern France. This related pattern is supported by the work of van der Knaap et al. (2005), which, on the basis of pollen-percentage threshold values, showed a northward post-glacial migration route throughout the Alps. Genetic approaches suggest an introgression zone between the eastern and western Mediterranean areas (Konnert & Bergmann, 1995; Liepelt et al., 2002), which could correspond to the contact between the lineages spreading from northern Italy and from Greece, respectively. On the other hand, the post-glacial spread throughout the western Alps was thought to originate from the northern Apennines, the Insubrian southern Alps and possibly south-eastern France (Terhürne-Berson et al., 2004; Hofstetter et al., 2006). Migrating from its northern Italian and Insubrian refugia, silver fir developed in the south-central Alps (Ticino, Switzerland) c. 10,000 cal. yr BP, and in the outer Alps (south-eastern Switzerland) around 9000 cal. yr BP (Burga, 1988; Burga & Hussendörfer, 2001). Despite the number of regional syntheses dealing with the post-glacial vegetation history of the southern French Alps (e.g. de Beaulieu, 1977; Clerc, 1988; Nakagawa, 1998), the migration of Abies alba is still poorly understood for this area. In particular: (1) the possible existence of glacial refugia in the south-western Alps is not yet elucidated and (2) the direction of the migration routes between the south-western and the north-western Alps remains unknown (Nakagawa, 1998).

### MATERIAL AND METHODS

### Palaeoecological data

The compiled pollen data set comprises 52 sites, located in the southern French Alps and adjacent hills and mountains, and nine sites in the adjacent plains (Table 1 & Fig. 2). The few computerized data were obtained from the European Pollen Database or directly from the authors. The major part of our data set (c. 45 sites) thus consists of published but not computerized data: the *Abies* pollen curves were extracted from published diagrams, and percentages were recalculated when sufficient information was available, with the aim of obtaining a homogeneous and reliable body of data. Pollen percentages are calculated on a pollen sum excluding Pteridophyta spores and local taxa (aquatic plants, Cyperaceae and *Alnus* in sites where its pollen is attributed to a local origin). Macrofossils are used when available to document the local presence of *Abies*.

					(1995)	(00	(1995)																								
Reference	de Beaulieu (1977)	1	Wegmüller (1977)	Nakagawa (1998)	Fauquette & Talon (1995), Fauquette (	Nakagawa (1998), Nakagawa et al. (20	Fauquette & Talon (1995), Fauquette (	S. D. Muller (unpublished data)	de Beaulieu (1974)	1	de Beaulieu (1977)	1	1	1	1	1	Nakagawa (1998)	1	de Beaulieu (1977)	1	1	de Beaulieu (1977), de Beaulieu & Reille (1983)	1	1	1	Muller et al. (2000)	de Beaulieu (1977)	Muller et al. (2000)	Nakagawa (1998)	de Beaulieu (1977)	I
Dating method	I	Bulk	Bulk	AMS	Bulk	AMS	Ι	AMS	I	Bulk	Bulk	I	Bulk	I	Bulk	I	AMS	AMS	I	Bulk	I	Bulk	I	Bulk	Bulk	AMS	Bulk	AMS	I	I	Bulk
Number of dates	I	4	3(-1)	7(-1)	2	ŝ	I	6(-1)	I	2	6(-2+6)	I	(+1)	I	4(+6)	I	2(-2)	1	I	4	I	2	I	1(-1)	3(+3)	1	9	4(-1)	I	I	1
Cores	CL-D38	CL-D39	CLA	COR	CRI-1	CRI-2	CRI-3	GOU-1	LLI-1	LLI-2	LLI-D26	LLI-D27	LLI-D28	CDL-D21	CDL-D22	CDL-D23	LIG	MIR	MOU-D29	MOU-D30	MOU-D31	PEL-D1	PEL-D2	PEL-D4	PEL-D5	PA	PDL-D16	PR	RAU	RDR-D20	SAB-D33
Geographical zone	Mercantour		Ubaye	Gapençais	Brianconnais	×		Gapençais	Mercantour					Briançonnais			Haut-Verdon	Queyras	Mercantour			Gapençais				Briançonnais	Haut-Verdon	Briançonnais	Gapençais	Embrunnais	Mercantour
Altitude (m)	2260		2100	1090	2248			992	2093					1784			2273	2210	2175			975				1850	2122	1800	1770	950	2216
Latitude	44°09' N		44°22' N	44°33′ N	45°00' N			44°23′ N	44°03′ N					45°46' N			44°06' N	44°38' N	44°03′ N			44°31' N				44°58' N	44°14' N	44°55′ N	44°30' N	44°44' N	44°08' N
Longitude	07°14' E		06°47' E	05°59' E	06°36' E			06°11' E	07°27' E					06°32' E			06°43' E	06°48' E	07°27' E			06°11' E				06°35' E	06°42' E	06°35' E	05°56' E	06°35' E	07°28' E
Nature of site	Peatland		Fen	Marsh	Lake			Marsh	Lake					Lake			Lake	Lake	Lake			Marsh				Fen	Fen	Fen	Marsh	Lake	Marsh
Site	Clapeyret		Clapouse (la)	Corréo	Cristol (lac)			Gourre (la)	Lac long inférieur					Lauzes (col des)			Lignin	Miroir	Mouton (lac)			Pelléautier				Plaine Alpe	Plan du Laus	Pré Rond	Raux	Roche de Rame (la)	Sabion
Selection				R/Mou	R/Alp	ı			S/Alp					S/Sub					S/Alp			S/Mou					S/Alp	R/Sub			
	п		7	ŝ	4			Ŋ	9					4			8	6	10			11				12	13	14	15	16	17

**Table 1** Holocene pollen sequences in the southern French Alps (sites 1–22), adjacent mountainous areas (sites 23–52) and adjacent plains (53–61). Reference sites (**R**, denoted in bold) and

880

Journal of Biogeography **34**, 876–899 © 2007 The Authors. Journal compilation © 2007 Blackwell Publishing Ltd

Tab	ole 1 contir	ned									
	Selection	Site	Nature of site	Longitude	Latitude	Altitude (m)	Geographical zone	Cores	Number of dates	Dating method	Reference
18		Siguret	Lake	06°33' E	44°47' N	1066	Embrunnais	SIG-D17	I	I	1
		1						SIG-D18	1(+1)	Bulk	de Beaulieu (1977), de Beaulieu & Dailla (1983)
									ç	D11.	X Kelle (1903)
								SIG-1980	2 1(+6)	Bulk	– de Beaulieu & Reille (1983)
19	R/Mou	St-Léger	Lake	06°20' E	44°25' N	1308	Ganencais	SL-D9	6 60	Bulk	de Beaulien (1977)
							and and	SL-D10	ы го	Bulk	
								SL-D11	1	Bulk	1
								SL-B135m	12(-1)	AMS	Digerfeldt et al. (1997)
20		Vallon du Loup	Fen	06°24' E	44°24 <b>′</b> N	2010	Ubaye	VDL-D15	I	I	de Beaulieu (1977)
21	S/Alp	Vallon de Provence	Fen	06°24' E	44°23′ N	2075	Ubaye	VDP-D12	1(+1)	Bulk	I
								VDP-D13	9	Bulk	1
22		Vars (col de)	Lake	06°43' E	44°33′ N	2070	Embrunnais	VAR-D25	2	Bulk	de Beaulieu (1977)
23		Alpe de Vénosc	Fen	06°09' E	44°58' N	1644	Oisans	ADV	I	I	Coûteaux (1962)
24		Besset (le)	Fen	06°28' E	45°11' N	1834	Maurienne	BES	3(-1)	Bulk	Wegmüller (1977)
25		Boites	Lake	05°53' E	45°03′ N	1560	Taillefer	BOI	I	I	Nakagawa (1998)
26		Brande	Peatland	$06^{\circ}08' E$	45°05' N	1820	Oisans	BRA	I	I	Coûteaux (1982a, 1984
27		Canard (lac)	Peatland	05°57' E	45°04' N	2055	Taillefer	CAN-1A	5(-2)	Bulk	Ponel et al. (1992)
28		Chirens	Bog	05°34' E	45°25' N	460	Chartreuse	CHI-2a	1	Bulk	Wegmüller (1977)
								CHI-2b	ю	Bulk	1
29		Deux-Alpes	Peat	$06^{\circ}09' E$	45°05′ N	1650	Romanche	DA	I	Ι	Coûteaux (1983a)
30		Faudon (lac de)	Lake	06°13' E	44°36' N	1577	Champsaur	FAU	6	AMS	M. Court-Picon (unpublished data)
31	S/Mou	Forest en Dévoluy	Fen	05°54' E	44°45' N	1460	Dévoluy	FED-D8	5(+1)	Bulk	de Beaulieu (1977)
								FED	3(+1)	Bulk	Wegmüller (1977)
32		Fourchu (lac)	Peatland	05°56' E	45°03′ N	1070	Taillefer	FOU	3	Bulk	Ponel et al. (1992)
33	R/Sub	Gouille (la)	Peatland	06°12' E	45°26' N	1800	Belledonne	GO-1	ю	AMS	David (2001)
								GO-2	9	AMS	I
34		Grand Lemps	Pond	05°25' E	45°28′ N	500	Terres-Froides	GL-1	I	Bulk	Clerc (1988)
								GL-2	9	Bulk	I
								GL-3	5(-1)	Bulk	1
								GL-4	1(-1)	Bulk	1
35		Grand Ratz	Marsh	05°36' E	45°20' N	650	Chartreuse	GR	5(-1)	Bulk	I
36		Gypsières (les)	Fen	06°24' E	45°04' N	2500	Maurienne	GYP	I	I	Wegmüller (1977)
37		Laux du Villardon (le)	Pond	06°03' E	44°44' N	1090	Champsaur	LDV	7(-2)	AMS	Pothin (2000)
38		Lauza (le)	Fen	06°13' E	44°39′ N	1140	Champsaur	LAU-1	3	Bulk	Wegmüller (1977)
								LAU-2	8(-1)	AMS	M. Court-Picon (unpublished data)
39	R/Alp	Lauzons (lac des)	Fen	06°17' E	44°47' N	2180	Champsaur	LDL	11(-1)	AMS	I
40		Libouse	Meadow	06°13' E	44°38' N	1455	Champsaur	LIB	6	AMS	I

			Moture of				Construction		Mumbar of	Dating	
	Selection	Site	site	Longitude	Latitude	Altitude (m)	zone	Cores	dates	method	Reference
41	S/Mou	Luitel (col)	Bog	05°60' E	45°05' N	1250	Taillefer	LUI	ŝ	Bulk	Wegmüller (1977)
42	R/Mou	Montsec	Marsh	05°48' E	45°14' N	1130	Taillefer	MON-1	I	I	Nakagawa (1998)
								MON-2	Ū	AMS	I
43		Muzelle (la)	Peatland	06°06' E	44°57' N	2140	Oisans	MUZ	I	Ι	Coûteaux (1982b, 1983b
44	R/Mou	Peuil	Bog	05°39' E	45°07' N	970	Vercors	PEU	3(+1)	AMS	Nakagawa (1998)
45	R/Alp	Plan des Mains	Marsh	06°35' E	45°21' N	2080	Maurienne	PDM	5(-1)	Bulk	David (1995b, 1997)
									8	AMS	David (1997)
46	R/Mou	Praver	Lake	05°51' E	45°04' N	1170	Taillefer	PRA	7	AMS	Nakagawa (1998)
47	R/Alp	Pré Bérard	Fen	06°30' E	45°14' N	2020	Maurienne	PB	3	AMS	David & Barbero (2001)
48	S/Mou	Sagne de Canne	Fen	$06^{\circ}06' E$	44°37′ N	1270	Champsaur	SDC	7	AMS	M. Court-Picon (unpublished data)
49	S/Alp	Soie (la)	Peatland	06°27' E	45°09' N	2110	Maurienne	IOS	5(-1)	Bulk	Wegmüller (1977)
50		St-Hilaire-du-Rosier	Marsh	05°19' E	45°08' N	190	Vercors	SHR	(+2)	Bulk	Clerc (1985, 1988)
51		St-Julien-de-Ratz	Lake	05°37' E	45°21' N	650	Chartreuse	SJR-1	2(+2)	Bulk	1
								SJR-2	5(-3)	Bulk	Clerc (1988)
52	S/Mou	St-Sixte	Pond	05°37' E	45°27′ N	650	Chartreuse	SSI-1	3	Bulk	Clerc (1985, 1988)
								SSI-2	4(-1)	Bulk	Clerc (1988)
53		Baux de Provence	Marsh	04°48' E	43°41' N	2	Rhone valley	D9	I	I	Triat-Laval (1979)
								D10	6(-1)	Bulk	1
54		Beauchamp-Panières	Marsh	04°53' E	43°32′ N	45	Rhone valley	D5	I	Ι	1
								D6	(+1)	Bulk	1
								D7	4(-1+4)	Bulk	1
55		Berre (Pointe de)	Lagoon	05°09' E	43°27′ N	1.5	Rhone valley	D26	5(-4?)	Bulk	I
								D27	I	I	I
56		Biot	Estuary	07°07' E	43°38′ N	α.	Côte d'Azur	Biot-D1	6(-1?)	Bulk	Nicol-Pichard & Dubar (1998)
57		Courthezon	Marsh	04°52' E	44°05' N	32	Rhone valley	DI	Ι	I	Triat-Laval (1979)
								D2	5(+2)	Bulk	1
58		Frignants	Lagoon	04°29' E	43°31' N	0.7	Rhone delta	D23	4(+2)	Bulk	1
59		Meyranne	Marsh	04°43' E	43°37′ N	2	Rhone valley	D15	I	I	1
								D16	3	Bulk	1
60		Molleges	Marsh	04°56' E	43°37′ N	50	Rhone valley	D8	1(+1)	Bulk	I
61		Tourves	Marsh	05°56' E	43°25' N	298	Provence	Tourves	5(-1+3)	Bulk	Nicol-Pichard (1987)

Table 1 continued

Journal of Biogeography **34**, 876–899 © 2007 The Authors. Journal compilation © 2007 Blackwell Publishing Ltd



**Figure 2** Location of sites in the south-western Alps and adjacent areas. Site numbers refer to Table 1, except the sites denoted A (Aussois), M (St-Michel-de-Maurienne) and T (travertine sequences of St-Génix and Termignon). Sites located above 2000 m a.s.l., i.e. above the present-day tree line, are noted in white on black.

### **Chronological control**

The chronological setting of the study is provided by 290 <sup>14</sup>C dates performed on sedimentary sequences (see Appendix S1 in Supplementary Material), four U/Th dates and 14 <sup>14</sup>C dates performed on travertine deposits and on charcoal from soils, respectively (Table 2). As for pollen data, radiocarbon dates were obtained partly from the authors directly and partly from previously published papers, which did not always give all the relevant information. Among the 52 pollen sequences available in the study area, only 44 have at least one radiocarbon date,

often of variable quality. Consequently, we first selected a reference body of high-quality sequences, by excluding: (1) sequences dated on bulk sediments, because the use of uncontrolled dated material may result in dating errors caused by hard-water effects, and (2) those with fewer than three radiocarbon dates or an incomplete Holocene record. The so-defined reference body contains 11 pollen sequences, characterized by a consistent accelerator mass spectrometry (AMS) radiocarbon dating carried out on terrestrial plant macrofossils. Second, this reference body is compared with 11 supplementary sites, well dated on bulk sediments, in order to

Site	Longitude	Latitude	Altitude (m)	Laboratory code	Level/depth	Measured age (yr BP)	Calendar age (cal. yr BP)
Aussois 1	45°15' N	06°45' E	1750	Lyon-870(OxA)	15–30 cm	3675 ± 55	3842-4149
				AA-20464	15-30 cm	$1025 \pm 100$	733–1170
Aussois 4	45°15' N	06°45' E	1900	Lyon-871(OxA)	30–50 cm	$4730 \pm 45$	5324-5586
				Lyon-872(OxA)	30–50 cm	$3990 \pm 40$	4301-4568
				Lyon-873(OxA)	30–50 cm	$3745 \pm 45$	3932-4238
Maur 6	45°15' N	06°30' E	1770	Lyon-865(OxA)	20-40 cm	$4040 \pm 55$	4407-4811
				Lyon-866(OxA)	40-60 cm	$4605 \pm 45$	5052-5467
				Lyon-867(OxA)	60–85 cm	$6070 \pm 50$	6753–7155
				Lyon-868(OxA)	60–85 cm	$5550 \pm 55$	6204–6445
				AA-14776	90–120 cm	$5590 \pm 65$	6209-6500
Maur 13	45°15' N	06°30' E	1770	Lyon-1078(OxA)	35–40 cm	$4100 \pm 50$	4444-4821
				Lyon-302(OxA)	45–60 cm	$3580 \pm 65$	3692-4083
				Lyon-869(OxA)	65–80 cm	$4455 \pm 55$	4873-5292
				AA-20476	110–130 cm	$3800\pm65$	3988-4407
St-Génix	45°17' N	06°55′ E	1695	Ifm-Geomar, Kiel	A-3	7908 ± 195	7713-8103
				Ifm-Geomar, Kiel	A-9	$5300 \pm 133$	5167-5433
				Ifm-Geomar, Kiel	B-4	$3025 \pm 149$	2876-3174
Termignon	45°18′ N	06°49' E	1537	Ifm-Geomar, Kiel	3–2	$6010 \pm 350$	5660-6360

**Table 2** U/Th ages of travertine sequences containing *Abies* remains (St-Génix, Termignon) and <sup>14</sup>C ages of *Abies* charcoals from soils in Savoie, northern French Alps (St-Michel-de-Maurienne, Aussois; from Carcaillet, 1996; Carcaillet & Muller, 2005).

refine the geographical coverage. The remaining poorly dated sites are used to verify the consistency of the regional vegetation dynamics.

Because the varying duration of the <sup>14</sup>C year is likely to bias the interpolation of conventional radiocarbon ages, the chronology used is only based on calibrated radiocarbon dates. Despite the above-mentioned problems, conventional ages (uncalibrated <sup>14</sup>C years) are still commonly used, even in broad-scale syntheses based on between-site correlations (e.g. Terhürne-Berson et al., 2004). Calibrated ages (cal. yr BP) are computed with the CALIB 5.0 program (Stuiver & Reimer, 1993), using the calibration data set INTCAL04.14c (Reimer et al., 2004) (Table 3). Age-depth models (Fig. 3) were constructed by interpolating the simplest curve connecting calibrated dates within the 2-sigma confidence intervals (smooth spline interpolation; Guiot & Goeury, 1996). They integrate stratigraphic changes, which may result in abrupt variations in sedimentation rate. Confidence intervals, taking into account the thickness of dated levels, are interpolated to all samples of each pollen sequence, in order to evaluate the influence of radiocarbon age uncertainties on the precision of the reconstruction (Davis et al., 1986).

### Phases of Abies migration from pollen data

Watts (1973), Birks (1986), Lang (1992) and van der Knaap *et al.* (2005) discuss the interpretation of the different phases of tree migration from pollen-stratigraphic patterns. According to these authors, we can pinpoint the three following phases in *Abies* pollen curves: (1) approaching area limit, corresponding to the first scattered occurrences (less than 1%), (2) immigration (i.e. first arrival) and establishment of fir populations, corresponding to the beginning of the continuous curve, often

combining around 1% occurrences, and (3) expansion of fir populations, corresponding to the beginning of the strong increase in pollen percentages.

Low percentages may cause problems in interpretation, notably due to their high sensitivity to the size of the pollen sum, counting errors, long-distance transport and possible contamination (van der Knaap et al., 2005). Furthermore, rare or scattered trees, whose local past presence is evidenced by dated macroremains, can escape detection by pollen (Kullman, 1996, 1998, 2002; Ali et al., 2003, 2005; Brubaker et al., 2005; Tinner & Lotter, 2006). The ages interpolated for the approaching area limit are thus more questionable than the ones proposed for the subsequent phases. Moreover, local- and stand-scale parameters, e.g. altitude, size of the lake or peat basin, and local vegetation structure, may create variance between pollen records. Indeed, large basins and sites located above the tree line record much better the regional vegetation than small basins and sites at lower altitudes, which essentially trap a more local pollen rain (Jacobson & Bradshaw, 1981; Muller et al., 2006). To sum up, the interpretation is adapted to each diagram and problematic ages are excluded.

### RESULTS

### Approaching area limit

The first scattered pollen occurrences may be interpreted as the approaching area limit of silver fir (Figs 4 & 5). The earliest are recorded around 11,000 cal. yr BP in southern Mercantour and Grenoble Pre-Alps, i.e. at both extremities of the southern French Alps (Fig. 6). The important uncertainties of the related radiocarbon ages, ranging from  $\pm 280$  to  $\pm 680$  years,

Table 3 Calibrated radiocarbon dates for selected sites: reference ones (bold print) and supplementary ones (normal print).

	Site	Core	Depth (cm)	Sample code	<sup>14</sup> С age (уг вр)	Calibrated interval $2\sigma$	Used age (cal. yr BP)
3	Corréo	COR	177.5	GrA-6601	$2580 \pm 80$	2370-2850	2850
			301-302.5	GrA-7789	$5450\pm80$	6000-6400	6400
			390	GrA-6612	$5810 \pm 80$	6410-6790	6790
			530.5-534.5	GrA-6602	$7110 \pm 80$	7750-8150	8150
			579–582	GrA-6595	$7550 \pm 80$	8180-8520	8520
			649–652	GrA-6607	$9670 \pm 90$	10750-11230	11230
			713.5–720.5	GrA-6597	$9220 \pm 480$	9150-11970	Reject
4	Cristol (lac)	CRI-1	40-50	Ly-6109	$1970 \pm 65$	1740-2110	2110
			60-70	Ly-6110	$2500 \pm 80$	2360-2740	2740
		CRI-2	67.5–70	GrA-6611	$5040 \pm 80$	5610-5920	5610
			102.5-105	GrA-6613	$6380 \pm 90$	7030-7470	7470
			117.5–120	GrA-6609	$7910 \pm 80$	8560-9000	8780
31	Forest en Devoluy	FED-D8	60-65	Ly-1144	$5100 \pm 150$	5580-6270	5925
			120-125	Ly-1143	$7570 \pm 190$	/980-89/0	8600
			125-155	Ly-782	$8310 \pm 180$	8/20-9630	9000
			138-145	Ly-1142	$8440 \pm 320$	8610-10210	9600
			145-155	Ly-781	$9220 \pm 220$	9770-11100	10435
22	Covilla (la)	CO 1	1/0-1/5	Ly-780	$10850 \pm 500$	2210 2840	2575
55	Gouille (la)	60-1	102	AA-20085	$2490 \pm 120$ $3050 \pm 60$	2310-2840	4365
			220	AA-20083	$3930 \pm 00$ $4715 \pm 70$	5320 5590	5455
		60-2	170	AA-20084	$4713 \pm 70$ 6200 ± 70	5520 <del>-</del> 5590 6910-7270	7090
		00-2	200	AA-20082	$8105 \pm 75$	8730-9280	8730
			200	AA-20080	$8190 \pm 75$ $8190 \pm 85$	9000-9430	9215
			256	AA-20081	$8325 \pm 80$	9090_9490	9400
			290	AA-20079	$8715 \pm 75$	9530-10120	9825
			388	AA-20078	$9640 \pm 170$	10440-11600	11020
6	Lac long inférieur	LLI-D26	40-45	Lv-1244	2660 + 190	2330-3320	2825
			60-65	Lv-1243	$3740 \pm 160$	3640-4530	4085
			80-85	Ly-1242	$4770 \pm 300$	4650-6200	5425
			100-105	Ly-1241	$5670 \pm 170$	6020-6890	6890
			130-135	Ly-1240	8730 ± 220	9270-10370	9270
			140-145	Ly-1239	9330 ± 220	9930-11210	9930
			212-217	Ly-1208	$11270 \pm 230$	12830-13610	Reject
			217-225	Ly-1207	$10430 \pm 210$	11410-12840	12840
			225-235	Ly-1206	$10970 \pm 370$	11820-13660	13300
			235-245	Ly-1205	$12040 \pm 370$	13220-15070	13700
			245-255	Ly-1237	$12170 \pm 280$	13460-15010	14200
			255-265	Ly-1236	$12510\pm370$	13670-15700	15000
			266–278	Ly-1235	$13460 \pm 410$	14790-17210	16000
7	Lauzes (col des)	CDL-D22	45-50	Ly-1234	$2980 \pm 130$	2810-3450	2810
			190–195	Ly-1279	$5680 \pm 170$	6020-6890	6455
			280-285	Ly-1280	$7510 \pm 150$	8010-8590	8590
			373–378	Ly-1281	$9860 \pm 200$	10710-12040	11375
39	Lauzons (lac des)	LDL	18–19	AA-46928	$729 \pm 50$	560-720	640
			22–23	AA-46929	929 ± 31	740–930	835
			29-30	AA-46930	$1249 \pm 32$	1070-1270	1170
			34–35	AA-46931	$1947 \pm 46$	1800-1980	1890
			44-45	AA-46933	$2949 \pm 53$	2940-3260	3100
			60-61	AA-46934	$4136 \pm 52$	4450-4830	4640
			77–78	AA-46935	5547 ± 65	6200-6330	6460
			96–97	AA-46937	5242 ± 55	5910-6180	Reject
			117–118	AA-46938	7679 ± 58	8340-8550	8445
			124–125	AA-46939	8007 ± 46	8610-8990	8800
			142–144	AA-46940	$9701 \pm 71$	10490-11000	10745

	Site	Core	Depth (cm)	Sample code	<sup>14</sup> С age (уг вр)	Calibrated interval $2\sigma$	Used age (cal. yr BP)
42	Montsec	MON-2	45.5-49.5	GrA-7790	$450\pm50$	320-620	620
			90.5-92.5	GrA-7791	$1850\pm60$	1620-1920	1920
			145.5-149.5	GrA-6599	$7560 \pm 90$	8190-8540	8190
			246-249	GrA-7792	$8830\pm100$	9560-10190	10190
			310	GrA-6600	$9940 \pm 140$	11100-12000	11550
10	Mouton (lac)	MOU-D30	55-60	Ly-247	$3000 \pm 190$	2750-3610	3180
			115-120	Ly-1249	$8220\pm200$	8610-9540	8610
			125-130	Ly-1248	$7930 \pm 170$	8410-9250	9250
			200-205	Ly-1246	$9340 \pm 240$	9920-11230	10570
44	Peuil	PEU	50.5-54.5	GrA-6585	$6810 \pm 80$	7510-7830	7670
			75.5-79.5	GrA-6590	$8120 \pm 90$	8720-9400	9400
			105.5-109.5	GrA-6610	$9670 \pm 90$	10750-11230	10750
			224	GrA-6584	$11230 \pm 90$	12940-13270	13105
13	Plan du Laus	PDL-D16	240-250	Lv-995	$5820 \pm 150$	6300-6980	6300
			305-325	Lv-960	$7310 \pm 140$	7860-8390	8000
			450-455	Lv-996	8630 + 200	9140-10220	9200
			460-465	Ly-997	$8320 \pm 180$	8730-9660	9400
			510-520	Ly-998	$8970 \pm 210$	9540-10570	10055
			570-590	Ly-961	$8820 \pm 370$	9000-11070	10800
45	Plan des Mains	ррм	570-590	Ly-901	$3820 \pm 570$ $2455 \pm 60$	2360 2710	2535
45	r fair des mains	I DM	78 80	AA 15115	$2433 \pm 60$ 2740 ± 60	2500-2710	2355
			70-00	AA-15115	$2740 \pm 60$	2730-2900	2033
			90 107 109	AA 15117	$3330 \pm 60$	4200 4910	3700
			107-108	AA-15117	$4025 \pm 65$	4300-4810	4500 Not wood
			123	A-7942	$4345 \pm 260$	4240-5590	Not used
			152	AA15116	5502 ± 95	6010–6490 7170–8040	0200
			170	A-7943	$6765 \pm 250$	/1/0-8040	Not used
			196	A-7944	$8450 \pm 290$	8650-10190	Not used
			210	A-7945	$9900 \pm 420$	10290-12690	Reject
			220	AA-15119	$8515 \pm 90$	9300–9690	9300
			239	AA-15120	$8870 \pm 100$	9630-10220	9800
			244	A-7941	$8825 \pm 650$	8350-11810	Not used
			259	AA-15121	$9100 \pm 100$	9920-10550	10550
46	Praver	PRA	197.5	GrA-6580	$810 \pm 80$	570–920	920
			231–234	NUTA-	$1520 \pm 120$	1180-1700	1180
			327	GrA-6582	$2060 \pm 80$	1830-2300	2065
			603	GrA-6586	$4540\pm80$	4890-5460	5175
			795	GrA-6608	$7830 \pm 320$	8040-9440	8740
			815.5-819.5	GrA-6588	$8520 \pm 90$	9300-9700	9300
			893-897	GrA-6587	$9460 \pm 90$	10440-11100	10770
47	Pré Bérard	PB	255	Ly-404	$5850~\pm~55$	6500–6780	6500
			440	Ly-405	$7490\pm60$	8190-8400	8400
			525	Ly-406	$8660 \pm 65$	9530-9890	9710
14	Pré Rond	PR	92	Lyon-648	$3965 \pm 50$	4250-4570	4500
			115	Poz-10818	$4660\pm40$	5310-5570	5500
			136-140	Poz-10819	$7900\pm50$	8590-8980	Reject
			160	Lyon-649	$7660 \pm 65$	8360-8590	8475
48	Sagne de Canne	SDC	26-27	AA 50236	$1083 \pm 32$	930-1060	1060
			34-35	AA 50235	$1888 \pm 35$	1720-1920	1720
			46-47	AA 50234	2179 ± 35	2070-2320	2320
			59–60	AA 50233	3378 ± 37	3480-3700	3480
			79-80	AA 50232	3996 ± 38	4320-4770	4770
			94–95	AA 50231	6736 ± 45	7510-7670	7510
			119-120	AA 50230	7858 ± 58	8520-8980	8750
49	Soie (la)	SOI	70	B-2462	$3050 \pm 100$	2960-3450	3205
	0010 (m)		120	B-2461	$3290 \pm 100$	3260-3830	Reject
			170	B_2460	$6790 \pm 110$	7440_7910	7600
			170	D-2400	0790 ± 110	/440-/910	7000

# S. D. Muller *et al.*

# Table 3 continued

	Site	Core	Depth (cm)	Sample code	<sup>14</sup> С age (уг вр)	Calibrated interval $2\sigma$	Used age (cal. yr BP)
-			220	B-2459	7670 ± 110	8200-8720	8600
			290	B-2458	$8950 \pm 130$	9610-10380	9995
19	St-Léger	SL-B135m	260.0	Ua-4127	$970 \pm 65$	730-1050	890
			342.5	Ua-4126	$1195 \pm 70$	970-1270	1270
			402.5	Ua-4125	$1665 \pm 60$	1410-1700	1700
			462.5	Ua-4124	$2490 \pm 65$	2360-2730	2360
			612.5	Ua-4123	$3405\pm65$	3480-3830	3830
			625.0	Ua-4140	$3650\pm80$	3720-4230	3975
			652.5	Ua-4139	$4860 \pm 85$	5330-5860	Reject
			715.0	Ua-4138	$4580\pm80$	4970-5580	5400
			745.0	Ua-4137	$5220\pm105$	5740-6270	6270
			767.5	Ua-4122	$6920 \pm 65$	7620–7930	7620
			777.5	Ua-4136	$7255 \pm 90$	7880-8310	8310
			800.0	Ua-4135	$8975 \pm 105$	9700-10370	10035
21	Vallon de Provence	VDP-D13	140-150	Lv-840	$3840 \pm 70$	4000-4420	4210
			235-245	Lv-841	$5680 \pm 70$	6320-6630	6320
			280-290	Lv-842	$6010 \pm 110$	6570-7170	6900
			360-370	Lv-843	$7080\pm75$	7730-8020	8020
			385-390	Lv-844	$7880\pm120$	8430-9010	8600
			453-458	Ly-1284	9750 ± 200	10560-11950	11255

Table 3 continued

prevent us from detecting an obvious geographical pattern for this phase.

### **Immigration phase**

The immigration of silver fir is first recorded immediately prior to 10,000 cal. yr BP, both in southern Mercantour and in the Grenoble Pre-Alps (Figs 5 & 6). Macroremains indicate the local presence of *Abies* since 9300 cal. yr BP near Grenoble, 8700 cal. yr BP on the Belledone Massif, 8500 cal. yr BP in the Middle Durance Valley and 7900 cal. yr BP in the Maurienne Valley (Tables 3 & 4). The immigration phase spans *c*. 1000 years, not only within the whole study area but also within small regions such as the Middle Durance, the Grenoble Pre-Alps and the Maurienne Valley. The approximate synchronicity of records both in the north and the south of the western Alps does not provide evidence for obvious migration routes (Fig. 7).

#### Expansion phase

The first development of dense fir forests, recorded in the different zones of the outer French Alps between 9600 and 9000 cal. yr BP, appears to have been relatively synchronous based on the reliability and precision of the chronologies (Fig. 6). Here, the lack of a clear geographical pattern is likely to result from the expansion of already present populations established during the *immigration phase*. The build-up of the fir population is thus mainly controlled by local ecological conditions. However, two sequences located in the high Durance Valley (Col des Lauzes, Pré Rond; numbers 7 and 14, Fig. 2) suggest a later expansion of fir populations beginning around 6600–6500 cal. yr BP. This is supported by

the late ages obtained on *Abies* macroremains in the Guisane Valley (5500 and 4700 cal. yr BP; Table 4). This indicates a delay of several millennia in the spread of fir forests in the central part of the dry continental western Alps.

### DISCUSSION

# Testing the hypothesis of glacial refugia of fir in the south-western Alps and adjacent areas

Several glacial refugia of *Abies* have been postulated in southeastern France based on pollen occurrences: (1) in the Maritime Alps (de Beaulieu, 1974; Nicol-Pichard & Dubar, 1998; Terhürne-Berson *et al.*, 2004), (2) on coastal palaeovalleys close to the Rhone Delta (Triat-Laval, 1979, 1982), (3) in eastern Provence (Nicol-Pichard, 1987), and (4) in the Grenoble Pre-Alps (Clerc, 1988).

As noted by Nakagawa (1998), the lack of synchronicity in the spread of fir between the French Alps and the Massif Central, where it developed after 7000 cal. yr BP (de Beaulieu *et al.*, 1984), implies that the Rhone Valley constituted a geographical barrier to its progression and suggests it is highly improbable that refugia persisted at low altitudes, within its alluvial basin and in the adjacent plains of Provence (Fig. 2). The discontinuous occurrences of *Abies* pollen (Table 4) recorded in the low Rhone Valley (Triat-Laval, 1979) and in Provence (Nicol-Pichard, 1987) during the late-glacial period consequently do not provide evidence for regional refugia. The record at Biot (number 56, Fig. 2) could indicate the persistence of fir in lower valleys of the Mediterranean coastal rivers (Nicol-Pichard & Dubar, 1998). However, its expansion is dated there around 9500–9030 cal. yr BP, which would imply



Figure 3 Age-depth models for selected well-dated sites in the south-western Alps and adjacent areas. Error bars correspond to the 2-sigma confidence intervals (95.4%). All time scales span from 12 to 0 cal. ka BP, except for the Peuil site.



**Figure 4** Pollen and macrofossil records of *Abies* in selected sites in the south-western Alps and adjacent areas, dated by AMS of terrestrial plant macroremains. Triangles indicate radiocarbon dates. Macroremains are indicated by asterisks. Arrows and letters noted below the curves indicate the main steps of *Abies* migration: A, approaching area limit; I, migration (= first arrival); E, expansion (= population built up). Pollen percentages are based on a 100% sum excluding fern spores, Cyperaceae and aquatic taxa, and *Alnus* for COR and MON-2.

a non-equilibrium response to climate change, since the temperature increase was shown to occur 1 millennium before (Digerfeldt *et al.*, 1997; Davis *et al.*, 2003). With regard to the absence of a late-glacial diffusion of *Abies* in the French Mediterranean regions, its late expansion at Biot suggests arrival from Italy.

In the southern French Alps, the late-glacial sequences show sporadic and irregular occurrences of *Abies* pollen (Table 4). Recently, Terhürne-Berson *et al.* (2004) consider that the pollen of *Abies* found at the base of the first, poorly dated pollen sequences from Lac Long Inférieur (LLI-1 and LLI-2; de Beaulieu, 1974; Table 4) indicates a glacial refugium in southern Mercantour. This reinterpretation surprisingly does not take into account the later work of de Beaulieu (1977), which clearly shows, on the basis of supplementary pollen analyses (LLI-D26 to LLI-D28; Table 4), that the previous lateglacial pollen records resulted from contamination and that Abies did not persist during the LGM in altitudinal zones of the French Maritime Alps. The most continuous late-glacial records of *Abies* pollen in the southern French Alps are those of Pelléautier and la Roche de Rame, located in the middle Durance Valley (central part of the western Alps). However, in the first site, only one core among five shows any pre-Holocene pollen occurrences of *Abies*, and both sites are surrounded by others with no or only discontinuous late-glacial pollen records of fir (Table 4), which also eliminates the middle Durance as a potential refugial area.

Finally, in the northern French Alps, the results obtained by Nakagawa (1998) show similar, irregular late-glacial records of *Abies* pollen and do not justify the regional fir refugia postulated in the Grenoble Pre-Alps by Clerc (1988) and de Beaulieu *et al.* (1992). No macroremains from peat or lake sediments, plant imprints from travertine or charcoal from soil support the existence of *Abies* refugia in the western Alps and



Figure 6 Pattern of Abies migration in the southern French Alps. Radiocarbon dates performed on Abies macroremains are circled by a dashed line. The code and the reference number of the sites are noted below the diagrams. The interrogation points (?) indicate the ages obtained by extrapolation, with the aim of distinguishing these from those obtained by interpolation.

Ť

GO

North

ø

0

PB PDM

Vanoise

47 45 33

**Table 4.** Pollen occurrences of *Abies* in late-glacial sequences of south-western Alps and adjacent Mediterranean regions. The number of open dots corresponds to the number of pollen occurrences, three dots meaning three and more than three occurrences. Grey shading indicates periods for which evidence was recorded.



adjacent regions east of the Rhone Valley. Late-glacial pollen occurrences of *Abies* in the southern French Alps should therefore be considered as resulting from long-distance transport from the northern Apennines refugia (central Italy) or reworking from older sediments. Consequently, the regular pollen record of *Abies*, from 10,000 years ago in the western Alps (David, 1995a,b; Digerfeldt *et al.*, 1997; Nakagawa, 1998), would reflect its spread from Italian refugia. The consistent patterns of approaching area limit and immigration (Fig. 6), which show the earliest records in both the northern and southern extremities of the western Alps, suggest its arrival from distant regions.

# The pattern and dynamics of fir migration in the south-western Alps

As mentioned above, the important uncertainties concerning the oldest radiocarbon dates and the rarity of well-dated sites present serious difficulties in reconstructing the geographical pattern of *Abies* migration at the regional scale. However, the data presented allow us to establish some general features and to propose some hypotheses.

The oldest pollen records of approaching area limit and immigration of Abies are located both at the southern extremity of the Alps and in the western foot-hills close to Grenoble (Fig. 7), which could suggest simultaneous migration routes from the north and the south. The speed of the colonization by fir within the western Alps appears extremely rapid, at the scale of the time intervals observed within small regions and, for the most part, within the radiocarbon age errors (Fig. 6). On the one hand the rapidity of this process prevents the clear separation of actual dynamics from dating errors, but on the other hand it could be considered as supporting the idea of a multiorigin migration. However, the later ages of establishment of Abies in the north-western Alps (de Beaulieu et al., 1992; David, 1995a,b; David et al., 2001) and adjacent Jura (Richard, 1983; Reille, 1989) contradict the hypothesis of a migration route from the north and would rather support the idea of a northward spread throughout the south-western Alps, i.e. the French or Italian Alps. According to this second hypothesis, the rate of Abies range extension through the south-western Alps may be inferred from the dates of its establishment in southern Mercantour and in Grenoble Pre-Alps (Fig. 6): it appears to be up to 0.12 km year<sup>-1</sup>, and close to 2.3 km year<sup>-1</sup> if the estimated ages are correct, which is consistent with the apparent maximum range extension rate reported at a European scale by Davis (1981) and Huntley & Birks (1983). It must be noted that this roughly estimated rate also depends on the time interval between samples, and could be improved by increasing the temporal resolution of the palynological sequences used.

The slight delay of fir migration between the outer and the inner Alps (Fig. 7) and the location of the oldest Abies records within the wetter regions (Fig. 8) suggest a first wave of immigration restricted to the Pre-Alps as early as 10,100 cal. yr BP, before the colonization of the inner altitudinal zones between 9700 and 9000 cal. yr BP. Associated with the rapidity of the fir expansion over the entire French Alps, this diachronism could indicate that its migration was not only related to climate change but also controlled by dispersion processes, physiography and orographically induced precipitation patterns (Fig. 8). The quantitative pollen-based climate reconstructions for the south-western Alps (Digerfeldt et al., 1997; Davis et al., 2003), in agreement with independent European studies (e.g. von Grafenstein et al., 1998, 1999; Magny et al., 2001, 2003; Heiri et al., 2003, 2004), date the abrupt increase in temperature and precipitation of the beginning of the Holocene at c. 10,500 cal. yr BP, i.e. several centuries before the first pollen evidence for Abies immigration



**Figure 7** Pattern of migration (a) and expansion (b) of *Abies* in the south-western Alps and adjacent areas. The shape of sites indicates the type of dating: undated sequences ( $\triangle$ ), dating by AMS of terrestrial macroremains ( $\bigcirc$ ), by AMS of bulk sediments ( $\diamondsuit$ ) or by the conventional method using bulk sediments ( $\square$ ). For comments and legends, refer to Fig. 2.

in the French Alps. Since this date, the climatic conditions of the south-western Alps would have been as favourable to *Abies* development as today's. In this context, the successive 8.2 ka-type cooling events would have favoured its rapid expansion, as proposed for Central Europe by Tinner & Lotter (2006). This implies a complex response of the *Abies* range extension to early Holocene climate change: the 8.2 ka-type events would have controlled the timing of its spread while orographic parameters would have determined its spatial pattern. Finally, the rapidity of the early Holocene expansion of fir through the south-western Pre-Alps could be partly induced by the enhancement of its capacities of dispersion and colonization by the absence of competitors, such as spruce (*Picea abies*) and beech (*Fagus sylvatica*).

# The expansion and the dominance of fir forests in the south-western Alps

The formation of dense forests dominated by Abies alba began as early as 9600 cal. yr BP in southern Mercantour and maybe in Dévoluy, a northern and wet-oceanic massif located north of the city of Gap (Fig. 7). However, most populations of Abies expanded between 9000 and 8500 cal. yr BP, both in the southern (de Beaulieu, 1977; de Beaulieu & Reille, 1983; Digerfeldt et al., 1997; Nakagawa, 1998) and in the northern outer French Alps (Nakagawa, 1998; David et al., 2001; David, 2001). Fir forests were particularly well developed between 1000 and 1500 m a.s.l., although they reached and even exceeded 2000 m in numerous regions (e.g. Wegmüller, 1975; de Beaulieu, 1977; Tessier et al., 1993; David, 1995b, 2001; David & Barbero, 2001; Carcaillet & Muller, 2005; Muller et al., 2006). This extension is supported by the altitudinal location of present-day relict fir stands in the high Durance Valley. Macroremains found in peatlands, lake sediments, soils and travertine sequences document the local development of Abies in the French Alps from 1090 to 1900 m, between 9700-9300 and 1170-733 cal. yr BP (Tables 3 & 4).

As for the migration phase (Fig. 8), the expansion of Abies was delayed in the inner Alps. It occurred later, between 8400 and 8200 cal. yr BP in the Vanoise Massif and the Maurienne Valley (David, 1995a,b; David & Barbero, 2001), and around 6500 cal. yr BP in the high Durance valley (de Beaulieu, 1977; Muller et al., 2000). Because the Briançon region is the most arid zone in the whole Alps (Ozenda, 1985), the present-day rarity of Abies in this zone was ascribed for a long time to the climatic conditions there being unfavourable to its growth. Indeed, many experimental and dendrochronological studies report the elevated susceptibility of Abies alba to drought (e.g. Aussenac, 1980; Lévy & Becker, 1987; Becker, 1989; Tan & Bruckert, 1992; Guicherd, 1994; Desplanque et al., 1998a,b). However, its expansion occurred during an arid period of the Holocene, with major lake-level lowering (Digerfeldt et al., 1997), and resulted in the formation of extended subalpine forests, which developed on both sides of the valleys (Muller et al., 2000; Carcaillet & Muller, 2005). Despite the apparent lack of a relation between the general climate dynamics and the spread of fir forests, their very late expansion in the high Durance Valley (Fig. 6) could have resulted from harsh climatic conditions within the region. Besides, even if Abies constituted real forests up to the high inner valleys, the fir forests appear never to have attained an



**Figure 8** Possible isochrones of *Abies* migration (black lines) and present-day isohyets, linking points with identical annual precipitation (grey lines, delimiting greyed zones) in the southern French Alps (from Office National de la Météorologie, 1946). For comments and legends, refer to Fig. 2.

abundance there similar to the wet-oceanic foot-hills and Pre-Alps.

# CONCLUSIONS

The compiled palaeoecological data set allows the detection of some regional features concerning the post-glacial history of Abies alba in the south-western Alps. First, the late-glacial pollen sequences currently available from the French Alps and adjacent areas do not provide proof for the presence of glacial refugia for fir. The irregular late-glacial pollen records from south-eastern France may have resulted from sediment reworking or long-distance pollen transport from the Apennine and Insubrian refugia, which we regard as the only certain origins for the fir populations in west-central Europe. Second, whereas the data are still insufficient for a precise reconstruction of the migration patterns, they provide evidence for the rapid spread of Abies throughout the south-western Alps, which only occurred over a few centuries, at a rate estimated, in a first approximation, to be around 2.3 km year<sup>-1</sup>. This feature, implying a non-limiting climate (i.e. a non-equilibrium state), supports the idea of an immigration from distant refugia, later than the climate improvement at the late-glacial-Holocene transition. Third, we demonstrate a delayed expansion of *Abies* in the inner valleys compared with external foot-hills, which may be attributed to their well-known aridity. Climatic conditions consequently appear to have influenced the post-glacial history of *Abies* in the south-western Alps more through their spatial heterogeneity than through their temporal changes.

These results clearly point to the need for such regional syntheses, allowing reliable data to be distinguished from biased data within the whole available data set, and consequently provide valuable past regional biogeographical patterns. Such work should ideally be realized before broad-scale reconstructions, in an attempt to avoid the propagation of erroneous local reconstructions, often related to a selection of unreliable data. Moreover, our study points to the lack of highresolution, well-dated pollen and macrofossil sequences in the south-western Alps (Fig. 8). An intensive research effort on selected sites could allow more precise reconstructions of the patterns of post-glacial migration of trees, and the determination of the respective influences of external factors (climate, physiography, disturbances) and internal ones (succession, competition, etc.).

Finally, the compiled data set allows us to evaluate the status of the present-day forests of *Pinus*, *Larix* and *Fagus* in the south-western Alps, as well as the biogeographical significance of the relict fir populations in the Durance Valley. The first ones clearly benefited from the decline of Abies, dated between 5500 and 3500 cal. yr BP (de Beaulieu & Goeury, 2004), and they may therefore be considered as secondary forests. Abies almost completely disappeared from most of the south-western Alps during the Roman era, around 2000 cal. yr BP. Only some limited fir stands persisted until today in remote areas. A map, dated to AD 1770 (Cassini, 1779-82), shows the existence of the present-day Bois de la Sapée, on the north-face of the Lure Massif (Provence, France), whose name is based on the French name for fir (sapin). This archive attests to the survival of fir stands in the southern massifs during a period of severe forest exploitation for domestic use and industries (Barruol et al., 2004). The relict fir forests of the high Durance Valley probably owed their survival to their location at high elevations, around 2000 m a.s.l., and on steep slopes. A particular case is the Boscodon fir forest, in the Durance Valley, at the boundary between the Pre-Alps and the inner Alps: during the Middle Ages, this forest benefited from protection by the monks of the Boscodon Abbaye.

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank H. J. B. Birks, J. N. Haas, W. O. van der Knaap, R. J. Whittaker and an anonymous referee for their constructive suggestions which helped to improve the manuscript. The research has been partly supported by the Eclipse-CNRS programme and by the French national ECCO programme (INSU). This publication is contribution 2006-064 of the Institut des Sciences de l'Evolution de Montpellier. The compiled pollen data set is available as supplementary material online (Supplementary Appendix S2).

# REFERENCES

- Ali, A.A. (2003) Les systèmes travertineux et la caractérisation des paléopaysages méditerranéens et subalpins: une approche géobotanique séquentielle à haute résolution spatiale, p. 140. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université de Montpellier-2, France.
- Ali, A.A., Carcaillet, C., Guendon, J.-L., Roiron, P., Quinif, Y. & Terral, J.-F. (2003) Early Holocene tree limits ecology at 2200 m a.s.l. in southern inner French Alps inferred from plant imprints within travertine. *Global Ecology and Biogeography*, **12**, 411–419.
- Ali, A.A., Carcaillet, C., Talon, B., Roiron, P. & Terral, J.-F. (2005) Pinus cembra (arolla), a common tree in the inner French Alps since the early Holocene and above the present tree line: a synthesis based on charcoal data from soils and travertines. *Journal of Biogeography*, **32**, 1659–1669.
- Aussenac, G. (1980) Comportement hydrique de rameaux excisés de quelques espèces de sapins et de pins noirs en phase de dessiccation. *Annales des Sciences Forestières*, **37**, 201–215.
- Barruol, G., Coste, P., Réparaz, A. and de Royer, J.-Y. (eds) (2004) La montagne de Lure, encyclopédie d'une montagne en

*Haute-Provence*. Les Alpes de Lumière, 145/146, Forcalquier, France, 320 pp.

- de Beaulieu, J.-L. (1974) Analyses polliniques des sédiments holocènes du Lac Long inférieur (Alpes-Maritimes). *Annales de l'Université de Provence*, **1**, 97–104.
- de Beaulieu, J.-L. (1977) Contribution pollenanalytique à l'histoire tardiglaciaire et holocène des Alpes méridionales françaises, p. 358. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- de Beaulieu, J.-L. & Goeury, C. (2004) Les premiers signes de l'anthropisation dans les Alpes françaises d'après l'analyse pollinique. Néolithisation précoce. Premières traces d'anthropisation du couvert végétal à partir des données polliniques (ed. by H. Richard), pp. 163–171. Presses Universitaires Franc-Comtoises, Besançon.
- de Beaulieu, J.-L. & Reille, M. (1983) Paléoenvironnement tardiglaciaire et holocène des lacs de Pelléautier et Siguret (Hautes-Alpes, France). I. Histoire de la végétation d'après les analyses polliniques. *Ecologia Mediterranea*, **9**, 19–36.
- de Beaulieu, J.-L., Coûteaux, M., Pons, A., Reille, M. & Triat-Laval, H. (1984) Première approche d'une histoire postwürmienne de quelques taxons arboréens dans le sud-est de la France. *Revue de Paléobiologie, Genève*, **NS**, 11–24.
- de Beaulieu, J.-L., Kostenzer, J. & Reich, K. (1992) Dynamique forestière holocène dans la haute vallée de l'Arve (Haute-Savoie) et migrations de Abies et Picea dans les Alpes occidentales. *Dissertationes Botanicae*, **196**, 387–398.
- Becker, J. (1952) Etude palynologique des tourbes flandriennes des Alpes françaises. *Mémoires du service de la Carte géologique d'Alsace et de Lorraine*, **11**, 61.
- Becker, M. (1989) The role of climate on present and past vitality of silver fir forests in the Vosges mountains of northern France. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, **19**, 1110–1117.
- Bennett, K.D., Tzedakis, P.C. & Willis, K.J. (1991) Quaternary refugia of north European trees. *Journal of Biogeography*, **18**, 103–115.
- Bergmann, F., Gregorius, H.F. & Larsen, J.B. (1990) Levels of genetic variation in European silver fir (*Abies alba*). Are they related to the species' decline? *Genetica*, **82**, 1–10.
- Bertoldi, R. (1968) Ricerche pollinologiche sullo sviluppo della vegetazione tardiglaciale e postglaciale nella vegetazione del Lago di Garda. *Studi Trentini di Scienze Naturali*, **45**, 87–162.
- Bertoldi, R. (1980) Le vicende vegetazionali e climatiche nella sequenza paleobotanica würmiana e post-würmiana si Lagdei (Appenino settentrionale). *Ateneo Parmense Acta Naturalia*, **16**, 147–175.
- Birks, H.J.B. (1986) Late-Quaternary biotic changes in terrestrial and lacustrine environments, with particular reference to north-west Europe. *Handbook of Holocene palaeoecology and palaeohydrology* (ed. by B.E. Berglund), pp. 3–65. Wiley, Chichester.
- Birks, H.H. & Birks, H.J.B. (2000) Future uses of pollen analysis must include plant macrofossils. *Journal of Biogeography*, **27**, 31–35.

- Bottema, S. (1974) Late Quaternary vegetation history of north-western Greece, p. 190. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, University of Groningen, Groningen.
- Brewer, S., Cheddadi, R., de Beaulieu, J.-L., Reille, M. & data contributors (2002) The spread of deciduous *Quercus* throughout Europe since the last glacial period. *Forest Ecology and Management*, **156**, 27–48.
- Brubaker, L.B., Anderson, P.M., Edwards, M.E. & Lozhkin, A.V. (2005) Beringia as a glacial refugium for boreal trees and shrubs: new perspectives from mapped pollen data. *Journal of Biogeography*, **32**, 833–848.
- Brugiapaglia, E. (1996) Dynamique de la végétation tardiglaciaire et holocène dans les Alpes italiennes nord-occidentales, p. 148. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- Burga, C.A. (1988) Swiss vegetation history during the last 18,000 years. *New Phytologist*, **110**, 581–602.
- Burga, C.A. & Hussendörfer, E. (2001) Vegetation history of *Abies alba* Mill. (silver fir) in Switzerland – pollen analytical and genetic surveys related to aspects of vegetation history of *Picea abies* (L.) H. Karsten (Norway spruce). *Vegetation History and Archaeobotany*, **10**, 151–159.
- van Campo, M. & Jalut, G. (1969) Analyse pollinique de sédiments des Pyrénées Orientales: lac de Balcère (1764m). *Pollen et Spores*, **11**, 253–262.
- Carcaillet, C. (1996) Évolution de l'organisation spatiale des communautés végétales d'altitude depuis 7000 ans BP dans la vallée de la Maurienne (Alpes de Savoie, France): une analyse pédoanthracologique, p. 171. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- Carcaillet, C. & Muller, S.D. (2005) Holocene tree-limit and distribution of *Abies alba* in the inner French Alps: anthropic or climatic changes? *Boreas*, **34**, 468–476.
- Cassini, C.-F. (1779–82) *Cartes au 86400<sup>e</sup>* no 121 (Vaison), no 122 (Avignon), no 152 (Embrun-Gap) et no 153 (Digne). Réédition IGN, Paris.
- Clerc, J. (1985) Première contribution à l'étude de la végétation tardiglaciaire et holocène du Piémont dauphinois. *Documents de cartographie écologique*, **28**, 65–83.
- Clerc, J. (1988) Recherches pollenanalytiques sur la paléoécologie tardiglaciaire et holocène du Bas-Dauphiné, p. 180. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- Conedera, M., Krebs, P., Tinner, W., Pradella, M. & Torriani, D. (2004) The cultivation of *Castanea sativa* Mill. in Europe: from its origin to its diffusion on a continental scale. *Vegetation History and Archaeobotany*, **13**, 161–179.
- Coûteaux, M. (1962) Analyse d'une tourbière des Alpes méridionales françaises: Alpe de Venosc. *Pollen et Spores*, **4**, 111– 120.
- Coûteaux, M. (1982a) Recherches pollenanalytiques en Oisans: le plateau de Brande (Alpes d'Huez, Isère, France). Bulletin de la Société Royale de Botanique de Belgique, 115, 91–106.
- Coûteaux, M. (1982b) La tourbière et le glacier de la Muzelle (Parc national des Ecrins). *Travaux Scientifiques du Parc National des Écrins*, **2**, 31–52.

- Coûteaux, M. (1983a) Géomorphologie et évolution phytogéographique tardiglaciaires et holocènes aux Deux-Alpes (Isère, France): contribution pollenanalytique. *Revue de Géographie Alpine*, **71**, 143–163.
- Coûteaux, M. (1983b) Fluctuations glaciaires de la fin du Würm dans les Alpes françaises, établies par des analyses polliniques. *Boreas*, **12**, 69–87.
- Coûteaux, M. (1984) Les particularités pollenanalytiques des sédiments glaciaires en Oisans (Isère, France). *La Houille Blanche*, **6**/**7**, 433–442.
- Culiberg, M. & Šercelj, A. (1995) Anthracotomical and palynological research in the palaeolithic site Šandalja II (Istria, Croatia). *Razprave IV, Razreda SAZU*, **36**, 49–57.
- David, F. (1993) Évolutions de la limite supérieure des arbres dans les Alpes françaises du Nord depuis la fin des temps glaciaires, p. 94. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- David, F. (1995a) Vegetation dynamics in the northern French Alps. *Historical Biology*, **9**, 269–295.
- David, F. (1995b) Mise en place des forêts d'altitude en Vanoise et périphérie. *Travaux Scientifique du Parc National de la Vanoise*, **19**, 91–106.
- David, F. (1997) Holocene tree limit in the northern French Alps stomata and pollen evidence. *Review of Paleobotany and Palynology*, **97**, 227–237.
- David, F. (2001) Etablissement des étages de végétation holocène vers la modélisation complète d'un massif. *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Sciences de Paris, Série III, Sciences de la Vie*, **324**, 273–278.
- David, F. & Barbero, M. (2001) Les érables dans l'étage subalpin: une longue histoire. Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Sciences de Paris, Série III, Sciences de la Vie, 324, 159–164.
- David, F., Farjanel, G. & Jolly, M.P. (2001) Palyno- and chronostratigraphy of a long sequence from Lac d'Annecy (northern outer Alps, France). *Journal of Paleolimnology*, **25**, 259–269.
- Davis, M.B. (1981) Quaternary history and the stability of forest communities. *Forest succession, concepts, and application* (ed. by D.C. West, H.H. Shugart and D.B. Botkin), pp. 132–153. Springer-Verlag, New York.
- Davis, M.B., Woods, K.D., Webb, S.L. & Futyma, R.P. (1986) Dispersal versus climate: Expansion of *Fagus* and *Tsuga* into the Upper Great Lakes region. *Vegetatio*, **67**, 93–103.
- Davis, B.A.S., Brewer, S., Stevenson, A.C., Guiot, J. & Data Contributors (2003) The temperature of Europe during the Holocene reconstructed from pollen data. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **22**, 1701–1716.
- Desplanque, C., Rolland, C. & Michalet, R. (1998a) Dendroécologie comparée du sapin blanc et de l'épicéa commun dans les zones internes des vallées alpines nord-occidentales. *Écologie*, **29**, 351–355.
- Desplanque, C., Rolland, C. & Michalet, R. (1998b) Dendroécologie comparée du sapin blanc (*Abies alba*) et de l'épicéa commun (*Picea abies*) dans une vallée alpine de France. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, **28**, 737–748.

- Digerfeldt, G., de Beaulieu, J.-L., Guiot, J. & Mouthon, J. (1997) Reconstruction and paleoclimatic interpretation of Holocene lake-level changes in Lac de Saint-Léger, Haute-Provence, southeast France. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, **136**, 231–258.
- Fady, B. (1995) Geographic variation in *Abies cephalonica* Loudon and related eastern Mediterranean *Abies* species from terpene and isozyme analysis: hypotheses on the phylogeny of Aegean species. *Population genetics and genetic conservation of forest trees* (ed. by P. Baradat, W.T. Adams and G. Müller-Starck), pp. 171–179. SPB Academic Publishing, Amsterdam.
- Fady, B. & Conkle, M.T. (1993) Allozyme variation and possible phylogenic implications in *Abies cephalonica* Loudon and some related eastern Mediterranean firs. *Silvae Genetica*, 42, 351–359.
- Fady, B., Arbez, M. & Marpeau, A. (1992) Geographic variability of terpene composition in *Abies cephalonica* Loudon and *Abies* species found around the Aegean: hypotheses for their possible phylogeny from the Miocene. *Trees*, **6**, 162– 171.
- Fady, B., Forest, I., Hochu, I., Ribiollet, A, de Beaulieu, J.-L. & Pastuszka, P. (1999) Genetic differentiation in *Abies alba* Mill. populations from south-eastern France. *Forest Genetics*, 6, 129–138.
- Fauquette, S. (1995) Etude paléoécologique (pollen et macrorestes) d'un site du Briançonnais: le Lac de Cristol (Hautes-Alpes, France). *Palynosciences*, **3**, 51–68.
- Fauquette, S. & Talon, B. (1995) Histoire de la végétation forestière d'un site du Briançonnais: le Lac de Cristol (Hautes-Alpes, France). Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Sciences de Paris, Série II, Sciences de la Terre, 321, 255–262.
- Gamisans, J. (1999) *La végétation de la Corse*, p. 391. Edisud, Aix-en-Provence.
- Giesecke, T. & Bennett, K.D. (2004) The Holocene spread of *Picea abies* (L.) Karst. in Fennoscandia and adjacent areas. *Journal of Biogeography*, **31**, 1523–1548.
- Gliemeroth, A.K. (1995) Paläoökologische Untersuchungen über die letzten 22 000 Jahre in Europa. Teil 2: Über die Wanderbewegungen europäischer Gehölzpflanzen im Spätglazial und Holozän. *Paläoklimaforschung*, **18**, 59–155.
- von Grafenstein, U., Erlenkeuser, H., Müller, J., Jouzel, J. & Johnsen, S.J. (1998) The cold event 8200 years ago documented in oxygen isotope records of precipitation in Europe and Greenland. *Climate Dynamics*, **14**, 73–81.
- von Grafenstein, U., Erlenkeuser, H., Brauer, A., Jouzel, J. & Johnsen, S.J. (1999) A mid-European decadal isotope-climate record from 15,500 to 5,000 years BP. *Science*, **284**, 1654–1657.
- Grüger, E. (1977) Pollenanalytische Untersuchung zur würmzeitlichen Vegetationgeschichte von Kalabrien (Süditalien). *Flora*, **166**, 475–489.
- Guicherd, P. (1994) Water relations of European silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) in two natural stands in the French Alps subject to contrasting climatic conditions. *Annales des Sciences Forestières*, **51**, 599–611.

- Guiot, J. & Goeury, C. (1996) 3Pbase a software for statistical analysis of paleoecological and paleoclimatological data. *Dendrochronologia*, **14**, 123–135.
- Heiri, O., Lotter, A.F., Hausmann, S. & Kienast, F. (2003) A chironomid-based Holocene summer air temperature reconstruction from the Swiss Alps. *The Holocene*, **13**, 477–484.
- Heiri, O., Tinner, W. & Lotter, A.F. (2004) Evidence for cooler European summers during periods of changing meltwater flux to the North Atlantic. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences USA*, **101**, 15285–15288.
- Hofstetter, S., Tinner, W., Valsecchi, V., Carraro, G. & Conedera, M. (2006) Late-glacial and Holocene vegetation history in the Insubrian Southern Alps – new indications from a small-scale site. *Vegetation History and Archaeobotany*, **15**, 87–98.
- Huntley, B. & Birks, H.J.B. (1983) An atlas of past and present pollen maps for Europe: 0–13,000 years ago, p. 667. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Jacobson, G.L. Jr, & Bradshaw, R.H.W. (1981) The selection of sites for paleovegetational studies. *Quaternary Research*, **16**, 80–96.
- Jalas, J. & Suominen, J. (1973) Atlas Florae Europaeae. Distribution of vascular plants in Europe. 2. Gymnospermae (Pinaceae to Ephedraceae). The Committee for Mapping the Flora of Europe and Societas Biologica Fennica Vanamo, Helsinki.
- Jalut, G. (1970) Données nouvelles concernant l'évolution de la végétation de l'extrémité orientale des Pyrénées au Tardiglaciaire et au Postglaciaire, d'après l'analyse pollinique. *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Sciences de Paris, Série D*, **270**, 3037–3039.
- Jalut, G. (1973a) Analyse pollinique de la tourbière de la Moulinasse: versant nord oriental des Pyrénées. *Pollen et Spores*, **15**, 471–509.
- Jalut, G. (1973b) Evolution du climat et de la végétation de l'extrémité orientale des Pyrénées au Tardiglaciaire et au Postglaciaire, d'après l'analyse pollinique. *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Sciences de Paris, Série D*, **276**, 2653–2656.
- van der Knaap, W.O., Leeuwen, J.F.N., Finsinger, W., Gobet, E., Pini, R., Schweizer, A., Valsecchi, V. & Ammann, B. (2005) Migration and population expansion of Abies, Fagus, Picea, and Quercus since 15,000 years in and across the Alps, based on pollen-percentage threshold values. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **24**, 645–680.
- Konnert, M. & Bergmann, F. (1995) The geographical distribution of genetic variation of silver fir (*Abies alba*, Pinaceae) in relation to its migration history. *Plant Systematics and Evolution*, **196**, 19–30.
- Kullman, L. (1996) Norway spruce present in the Scandes Mountains, Sweden at 8000 BP: new light on Holocene tree spread. *Global Ecology and Biogeography Letters*, **5**, 94–101.
- Kullman, L. (1998) Palaeoecological, biogeographical and palaeoclimatological implications of early Holocene immigration of *Larix sibirica* Lebed. into the Scandes

Mountains, Sweden. *Global Ecology and Biogeography Letters*, **7**, 181–188.

- Kullman, L. (2002) Boreal tree taxa in the central Scandes during the late-glacial: implications for Late-Quaternary forest history. *Journal of Biogeography*, **29**, 1117–1124.
- Lang, G. (1992) Some aspects of European late- and postglacial flora history. *Acta Botanica Fennica*, **144**, 1–17.
- Larsen, J.B. (1986) Das Tannensterben. Eine neue Hypothese zur Klärung dieser rätselhaften Komplexkrankheit der Weißtanne (*Abies alba* Mill.). Forstwissenschaftliches Centralblatt, 105, 381–396.
- Larsen, J.B. (1989) Waldbauliche Probleme und Genökologie der Weißtanne (*Abies alba* Mill.). *Allgemeine Forst- und Jagdzeitung*, **160**, 39–43.
- Lévy, G. & Becker, M. (1987) Le dépérissement du sapin dans les Vosges: rôle primordial de déficits d'alimentation en eau. *Annales des Sciences Forestières*, **44**, 403–416.
- Liepelt, S., Bialozyt, R. & Ziegenhagen, B. (2002) Wind-dispersed pollen mediates gene flow among refugia. *Proceedings* of the National Academy of Sciences USA, 99, 14590–14594.
- Lowe, J.J. (1992) Pollen stratigraphy and radiocarbon dating of late-glacial and Early Holocene lake sediments from the northern Apennines, Italy. *Boreas*, **21**, 319–334.
- Lowe, J.J. & Watson, C. (1993) Late-glacial and early Holocene pollen stratigraphy of the Northern Apennines, Italy. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **12**, 727–738.
- Magny, M., Guiot, J. & Schoellammer, P. (2001) Quantitative reconstruction of Younger Dryas to mid-Holocene paleoclimates at Le Locle, Swiss Jura, using pollen and lake-level data. *Quaternary Research*, **56**, 170–180.
- Magny, M., Bégeot, C., Guiot, J. & Peyron, O. (2003) Contrasting patterns of hydrological changes in Europe in response to Holocene climate cooling. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **22**, 1589–1596.
- Motta, R. & Edouard, J.-L. (2005) Stand structure and dynamics in a mixed and multilayered forest in the Upper Susa Valley, Piedmont, Italy. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*, **35**, 21–36.
- Motta, R. & Garbarino, F. (2003) Stand history and its consequences for the present and future dynamic in two silver fir (*Abies alba* Mill.) stands in the high Pesio Valley (Piedmont, Italy). *Annals of Forest Science*, **60**, 361–371.
- Muller, S.D., David, F. & Wicha, S. (2000) Impact de l'exposition et de l'anthropisation sur la dynamique forestière dans les Alpes du Sud (France). *Géographie Physique et Quaternaire*, **54**, 227–239.
- Muller, S.D., Nakagawa, T., de Beaulieu, J.-L., Court-Picon, M., Fauquette, S. & Genries, A. (2006) Paléostructures de végétation à la limite supérieure des forêts, dans les Alpes françaises internes. *Compte Rendus Biologies*, **329**, 502–511.
- Nakagawa, T. (1998) Etudes palynologiques dans les Alpes françaises centrales et méridionales: histoire de la végétation tardiglaciaire et holocène, p. 206. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- Nakagawa, T., Edouard, J.-L.M. & de Beaulieu, J.-L. (2000) A scanning electron microscopy (SEM) study of

sediments from Lake Cristol, southern French Alps, with special reference to the identification of *Pinus cembra* and other Alpine *Pinus* species based on SEM pollen morphology. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology*, **108**, 1–15.

- Nicol-Pichard, S. (1987) Analyse pollinique d'une séquence tardi- et postglaciaire à Tourves (Var, France). *Ecologia Mediterranea*, **13**, 29–42.
- Nicol-Pichard, S. & Dubar, M. (1998) Reconstruction of lateglacial and holocene environments in southeast France based on the study of a 66-m long core from Biot, Alpes Maritimes. *Vegetation History and Archaeobotany*, **7**, 11–15.
- Office National de la Météorologie (1946) *Carte des précipitations annuelles 1891–1930*. Section de climatologie de l'ONM, Paris.
- Ozenda, P. (1985) La végétation de la chaîne alpine dans l'espace montagnard européen, p. 331. Masson, Paris.
- Pérez-Obiol, R. & Julià, R. (1994) Climatic change on the Iberian Peninsula recorded in a 30,000-yr pollen record from Lake Banyoles. *Quaternary Research*, **41**, 91–98.
- Petit, R.J., Brewer, S., Bordács, S., Burg, K., Cheddadi, R., Coart, E., Cottrell, J., Csaikl, U.M., Deans, J.D., Fineschi, S., Finkeldey, R., Goicoechea, P.G., Jensen, J.S., König, A.O., Lowe, A.J., Madsen, S.F., Mátyás, G., Munro, R.C., Oledska, I., Popescu, F., Slade, D., Tabbener, H., van Dam, B., Ziegenhagen, B., de Beaulieu, J.-L. & Kremer, A. (2002) Identification of refugia and post-glacial colonisation routes of European white oaks based on chloroplast DNA and fossil pollen evidence. *Forest Ecology and Management*, **156**, 49– 74.
- Ponel, P. & Lowe, J.J. (1992) Coleopteran, pollen and radiocarbon evidences from the Prato Spila 'D' succession, N. Italy. *Comptes Rendus de l'Académie des Sciences de Paris*, *Série II, Sciences de la Terre*, **315**, 1425–1431.
- Ponel, P., de Beaulieu, J.-L. & Tobolski, K. (1992) Holocene palaeoenvironments at the timberline in the Taillefer Massif, French Alps: a study of pollen, plant macrofossils and fossil insects. *The Holocene*, **2**, 117–130.
- Pons, A. & Reille, M. (1988) The Holocene- and upper Pleistocene pollen record from Padul (Granada, Spain): a new study. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*, 66, 243–263.
- Pons, A., Reille, M., Triat, H., Coûteaux, M., Jalut, G., Öner, S., Planchais, N. & Vernet, J.-L. (1974) Les données historiques et l'étude de la flore méditerranéenne. La flore du bassin méditerranéen: essai de systématique synthétique. Colloques Internationaux du CNRS no. 235, Montpellier, 4–8 Juin. pp. 305–326. CNRS, Paris.
- Pothin, A. (2000) Impact de l'homme dans les milieux montagnards: analyse pollinique de la séquence du Laux (alt.: 1108 m, Champsaur, Hautes-Alpes), p. 38. Unpublished DEA Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- Quézel, P. & Médail, F. (2003) Ecologie et biogéographie des forêts du bassin méditerranéen, p. 571. Elsevier, Paris.
- Rameau, J.-C., Mansion, D., Dumé, G., Lecointe, A., Timbal, J., Dupont, P. & Keller, R. (1989–93) Flore forestière franç-

*aise, Guide écologique illustré,* 2 Vols. p. 4206. Institut pour le Développement forestier, Ministère de l'Agriculture et de la Pêche, Direction de l'Espace rural et de la Forêt, Ecole nationale du Génie rural, des Eaux et des Forêts, Paris.

- Ravazzi, C. (2002) Late Quaternary history of spruce in southern Europe. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology*, 120, 131–177.
- Reille, M. (1989) L'origine de la station de pin à crochets de la tourbière de Pinet (Aude) et de quelques stations isolées de cet arbre dans les Vosges et le Jura. *Revue de Sciences Naturelles d'Auvergne*, **55**, 65–85.
- Reille, M. & Lowe, J.J. (1993) A re-evaluation of the vegetation history of the eastern Pyrénées (France) from the end of the glacial to the present. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 12, 47–77.
- Reille, M., Gamisans, J., Andrieu-Ponel, V. & de Beaulieu, J.-L. (1999) The Holocene at Lac de Creno, Corsica, France: a key site for the whole island. *New Phytologist*, **141**, 291–307.
- Reimer, P.J., Baillie, M.G.L., Bard, E., Bayliss, A., Beck, J.W., Bertrand, C., Blackwell, P.G., Buck, C.E., Burr, G., Cutler, K.B., Damon, P.E., Edwards, R.L., Fairbanks, R.G., Friedrich, M., Guilderson, T.P., Hughen, K.A., Kromer, B., McCormac, F.G., Manning, S., Bronk Ramsey, C., Reimer, R.W., Remmele, S., Southon, J.R., Stuiver, M., Talamo, S., Taylor, F.W., der Plicht, J. & Weyhenmeyer, C.E. (2004) IntCal04 terrestrial radiocarbon age calibration, 0–26 cal kyr BP. *Radiocarbon*, 46, 1029–1058.
- Richard, H. (1983) Nouvelle contribution à l'Histoire de la végétation franc-comtoise tardiglaciaire et holocène à partir des données de la Palynologie, p. 155. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université de Besançon.
- Scaltsoyiannes, A., Tsaktsira, M. & Drouzas, A.D. (1999) Allozyme differentiation in the Mediterranean fir (*Abies*, Pinaceae). A first comparative study with phylogenetic implications. *Plant Systematics and Evolution*, **216**, 289–307.
- Schneider, R. (1978) Pollenanalytische Untersuchungen zur Kenntnis der spät- und postglazialen Vegetationgeschichte am Südrand der Alpen zwischen Turin und Tessin (Italien). Botanische Jahrbücher für Systematik, Pflanzengeschichte and Pflanzengeographie, **100**, 26–109.
- Šercelj, A. & Culiberg, M. (1991) Palynological and anthacotomical investigations of sediments from the Divje Babe I Palaeolithic site. *Razprave IV, Razreda SAZU*, **32**, 129–152.
- Stuiver, M. & Reimer, P.J. (1993) Extended <sup>14</sup>C database and revised CALIB radiocarbon calibration program. *Radiocarbon*, **35**, 215–230.
- Talon, B., 1997. Evolution des zones supra-forestières des Alpes sud-occidentales françaises au cours de l'Holocène. Analyse pédoanthracologique, p. 175. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- Tan, B.S. & Bruckert, S. (1992) Effet des facteurs physiques de l'environnement sur les premiers stades de la régénération naturelle du sapin pectiné (*Abies alba* Mill.) dans certaines stations du Jura. *Annales des Sciences Forestières*, **49**, 337– 350.
- Terhürne-Berson, R., Litt, T. & Cheddadi, R. (2004) The spread of *Abies* throughout Europe since the last glacial

period: combined macrofossil and pollen data. *Vegetation History and Archaeobotany*, **13**, 257–268.

- Tessier, L., de Beaulieu, J.-L., Coûteaux, M., Edouard, J.-L., Ponel, P., Rolando, C., Thinon, M., Thomas, A. & Tobolski, K. (1993) Holocene palaeoenvironment at the timberline in the Alps (Taillefer Massif, French Alps): a multidisciplinary approach. *Boreas*, 22, 244–254.
- Tessier du Cros, E. (coordinator) (1981) *Le hêtre*, p. 613. INRA, Paris.
- Tinner, W. & Lotter, A.F. (2006) Holocene expansions of Fagus silvatica and Abies alba in Central Europe: where are we after eight decades of debate? *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 25, 526–549.
- Triat-Laval, H. (1979) Contribution pollenanalytique à l'histoire tardi- et postglaciaire de la végétation de la basse vallée du Rhône, p. 343. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, Université d'Aix-Marseille-3.
- Triat-Laval, H. (1982) Pollenanalyse de sédiments quaternaires récents du pourtour de l'Etang de Berre. *Ecologia Mediterranea*, **8**, 97–115.
- Turk, I., Dirjec, J. & Culiberg, M. (1988–89) Divje Babe I Novo paleolitsko najdišče in Skupinsko Grobišče jamskeda medveda. *Arheološki Vestnik*, **39/40**, 13–60.
- Tutin, T.G., Heywood, V.H., Burges, N.A., Valentine, D.H., Walters, S.M. & Webb, D.A. (eds) (1964–80) *Flora Europaea*, 5 Vols. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Tzedakis, P.C., Lawson, I.T., Frogley, M.R., Hewitt, G.M. & Preece, R.C. (2002) Buffered tree population changes in a Quaternary refugium: evolutionary implication. *Science*, **297**, 2044–2047.
- Uzquiano, P. (1992) L'Homme et le bois au Paléolithique en région cantabrique, Espagne. Exemples d'Altamira et d'El Buxu. *Bulletin de la Société Botanique de France*, **139**, 361–372.
- Vicario, F., Vendramin, G.G., Rossi, P., Lio, P. & Giannini, R. (1995) Allozyme, chloroplast DNA and RAPD markers for determining genetic relationships between *Abies alba* and the relict population of *Abies nebrodensis*. *Theoretical and Applied Genetics*, **90**, 1012–1018.
- Watson, C.S. (1996) The vegetational history of the northern Apennines, Italy: information from three new sequences and a review of regional vegetational change. *Journal of Biogeography*, **23**, 805–841.
- Watts, W.A. (1973) Rates of change and stability in vegetation in the perspective of long periods of time. *Quaternary plant ecology* (ed. by H.J.B. Birks and R.G. West), pp. 195–206. Blackwell, Oxford.
- Watts, W.A. (1985) A long pollen record from Laghi di Monticchio, southern Italy: a preliminary account. *Journal of the Geological Society of London*, **142**, 491–499.
- Wegmüller, S. (1975) Les défrichements à l'étage subalpin dans la région de Valmeinier et de la vallée de la Valloire (Haute-Maurienne, Savoie). L'environnement et l'homme, pp. 309–315. INQUA, Montpellier.
- Wegmüller, S. (1977) Pollenanalytische Untersuchungen zur spät- und postglazialen Vegetationsgeschichte der französischen Alpen (Dauphiné), p. 185. P. Haupt, Bern.

Willis, K.J. & van Andel, T.H. (2004) Trees or no trees? The environments of central and eastern Europe during the Last Glaciation. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 23, 2369–2387.

### SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

The following supplementary material is available for this article:

**Appendix S1**. Conventional and AMS radiocarbon dates in the southern French Alps and adjacent areas.

Appendix S2. French Alps pollen data base.

This material is available as part of the online article from: http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1365-2699.2006.01665.x (This link will take you to the article abstract).

Please note: Blackwell Publishing are not responsible for the content or functionality of any supplementary materials supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the corresponding author for the article.

### BIOSKETCH

**Serge D. Muller** is a university lecturer (Maître de Conférences) at the University of Montpellier-2 and his major research interest focuses on wetland community dynamics and long-term vegetation history in temperate ecosystems. He studied for his doctorate in palaeoecology (palynology) at both the Universities of Montréal (Canada) and Marseille-3 (France). He has worked on landscape palaeoecology in the French Alps and on the conditions of peatland development and carbon accumulation in southern Québec.

Editor: John Birks